

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ח – כל הבשר

דף קד – 104 Daf

1. *Machlokes* if bird meat is considered meat **בשר בחלב** of איסור **מדאורייתא** for the

The eighth Perek begins: כל הבשר אסור לבשל בחלב – *all kinds of meat are forbidden to cook with milk*, except for the meat of fish or locusts. All kinds of meat are likewise forbidden to be brought onto the table together with cheese, except for fish or locusts. One who vows to abstain from meat may nevertheless eat fish or locusts. The Mishnah implies that bird meat is forbidden with milk **מדאורייתא**, and thus disagrees with Rebbe Akiva, who holds that the meat of a חיה or bird is not Biblically forbidden with milk. This is contradicted by the סיפא, which teaches that bird meat is included in a *neder* about "בשר". This follows Rebbe Akiva, who holds that anything which is similar enough to a requested item that a שליח will ask if the one who sent him wants it is included in such a *neder*, but the Chochomim hold bird meat is not included in his *neder*!? Rav Yosef answers that Rebbe, our Tanna, holds like the Chochomim that bird meat is Biblically forbidden with milk, but follows Rebbe Akiva regarding *nedarim*. Rav Ashi answers that our Mishnah merely implies that all meats are forbidden with milk, but מדברי סופרים – *some of them are forbidden Biblically, and some of them (i.e., birds) Rabbinically*.

2. Bringing **בשר** and cheese onto the table is not a **גזירה לגזירה**

The Mishnah forbids bringing up all kinds of meat together with cheese onto the table. Rav Yosef says this proves that bird meat with milk is forbidden **מדאורייתא**, because otherwise Chazal would not enact a second decree forbidding to bring them together onto the table, which would be *גזירה לגזירה* – *a decree to protect another decree*!? Abaye answers that bringing bird meat and cheese onto the table was not decreed to prevent them from being eaten together (which is itself only Rabbinically prohibited), rather to prevent meat of a **בהמה** from being brought together with cheese onto the table, leading to a Biblical violation of **בשר בחלב**. Rav Sheishess objects that even if bird meat would be **מדאורייתא** הוא, דאורייתא הוא, *in any event*, this would be merely *cold meat with cold cheese*, which is itself only prohibited *מדרבנן*!? Abaye explains we are concerned *שמא יעלה באילפס רותח* – *perhaps he will bring them up together in a hot pan*, meaning a *כלי ראשון* – *a primary vessel*, which would cook the meat and milk together and result in a Biblical transgression.

3. **בשר** and cheese do not require **נטילת ידים** or **קינוח הפה** between them

Agra, Rebbe Abba's father-in-law, taught a Baraisa: *bird meat and cheese may be eaten one after the other in a carefree manner*. He explains that bird meat may be eaten after cheese without **נטילת ידים** – *washing his hands* and without **קינוח הפה** – *wiping out his mouth* to remove dairy particles from his hands and mouth, which are required when eating meat of a **בהמה** after cheese.

Rav Yitzchak *brei d'Rav Mesharshiya* visited Rav Ashi's house and saw him eat cheese and then **בהמה** meat without washing his hands. He asked Rav Ashi that the above Baraisa implies that washing hands is required before eating **בהמה** meat, and Rav Ashi answered: this is only required at night, *אבל ביממא הא חזינא* – *but by day, I can see if there are dairy particles on my hands, and washing is unnecessary*.

Siman – Code

The caterer, who had just inherited his father's business and cracked the mysterious **code** left in the will instructing him to **serve chicken, not meat, to avoid getting near the איסור מדאורייתא**, explained to the waiters that it's not going too far to demand that they **don't put chicken and cheese on the same table**, but that they **don't have to tell the customers to wash their hands and mouths after the cheese before eating the chicken**.

דף קד | DAF 104

Code



The caterer, who had just inherited his father's business and cracked the mysterious **code** left in the will instructing him to **serve** chicken, not meat, to avoid getting near the **איסור דאורייתא** **בשר בחלב**, explained to the waiters that it's not going too far to demand that they **don't** put chicken and cheese on the same table, but that they **don't have to** tell the customers to **wash their** hands and mouths after the cheese before eating the chicken.

3 things to remember

1. **Machlokes** if bird meat is considered meat **מדאורייתא** for the **איסור** of **בשר בחלב**
2. Bringing **בשר עוף** and cheese onto the table is not a **גזירה לגזירה**
3. **בשר** and cheese do not require **נטילת ידים** or **קינוח הפה** between them

